



## **Sector Strategies Taskforce**

**September 9, 2014**

**Indiana Chamber of Commerce  
PNC/Hyatt Regency Building  
115 W. Washington St, Suite 850-S  
Indianapolis, IN 46204**

### **MEETING MINUTES**

**Members Present:** Brad Bishop, Roger Feldhaus, Jessica Fraser, Pat Kiely, Angie Klitzch (via phone), Amy Marsh (for Kevin Brinegar), Betsy McCaw, Scott Sanders, Rep. Ben Smaltz, Victor Smith

**Members Not Present:** Sen. Doug Eckerty, Tom Snyder

**Staff Present:** Jackie Dowd, Nate Klinck, Josh Schlake

#### **I. Welcome and Call to Order**

Taskforce Chair, Victor Smith, called the meeting to order at 10:30am, and welcomed members in attendance

#### **II. Review and Approval of August 12, 2014 Meeting Minutes**

Taskforce members reviewed the minutes from the August 12<sup>th</sup> meeting, and following review; Mr. Kiely motioned approval; Mr. Feldhaus seconded; motion passed.

#### **III. Review and Discussion of Career and Technical Education Return on Investment Study**

Ms. Dowd provided an introduction to the initial results of the CTE Return on Investment Study. She began by reminding taskforce members that the taskforce that HEA 1064, passed by the General Assembly in early 2014, called on the Career Council to complete a return on investment and utilization study of CTE programs in Indiana. She explained that the study is on-going, but that the initial results will be shared with the taskforce. Ms. Dowd shared that she anticipated the Governor's Office to utilize the results of the study to provide recommendations to the General Assembly before its next legislative session. She also shared that the next steps will involve sharing the initial results with stakeholders, and addressing the questions found within the findings.

Ms. Dowd then turned the floor to Mr. Schlake, who provided the taskforce with an overview of the current state for CTE funding within the State. Mr. Schlake shared that there currently is \$100M in State Funding and \$14.3M in federal Perkins funds available for CTE programs within Indiana. He shared that these funds are allocated to high schools based upon on the number of enrollments in specific courses, which are assigned a market demand and market wage category by DWD. These categories determine the amount of funding allocated to each enrollment. Mr. Schlake also provided

some examples of the funding levels provided in previous years, sorted by the specific courses that were funded.

Following Mr. Schlake's discussion, Ken Mall, of EDSI, the vendor selected by the Career Council to complete the ROI Study, provided the taskforce with a presentation highlighting the process that was used to conduct the study and the initial findings of the study. Among the items that Mr. Mall's presentation addressed were the following:

- Data shows that participation in CTE raises graduation levels
- CTE concentrators earn a great number of Core 40 Diplomas, but not a significantly large number of Core 40 with Academic Honors
- Data was not available for all cohorts that were analyzed – there was incomplete employment and earnings data due to the timeframe of cohorts studied
- Data tended to show that there was an earnings premium associated with students that concentrated in specific CTE pathways

The summary of outcomes that Mr. Mall provided the taskforce included the following:

- CTE participants as a whole have marginally better graduation rates compared to non-participants
- Most of CTE difference in performance is accounted for by the difference between the outcomes of concentrators and non-concentrators
  - Concentrators graduate at significantly higher rates
  - CTE participants receive a smaller percentage of honors diplomas, but a higher percentage of general diplomas.

Mr. Mall also provided the following initial recommendations that would be provided to the Career Council as it continues its analysis and study of Career and Technical Education:

- Focus opportunities on concentrators
- Align concentrators with industry demand for jobs
- Understand placement/employment in a field related to the education
- Evaluate potential outcomes, such as graduation rates, post-secondary completion, earning industry recognized credentials, and wages, based upon the area of concentration.

Throughout the presentation, the taskforce had significant discussions around the meaning of concentrators, and on the impact that being a concentrator had on the outcomes. They also discussed potential reasons that the reported earnings of participants is relatively low compared to average wages and earnings throughout Indiana. Members of the taskforce also expressed interest in further analyzing the outcomes that are associated with specific CTE courses, as that data appears to more clearly highlight the long-term benefits of CTE.

Following discussion on the analysis, taskforce members discussed a resolution that would be presented to the full Career Council at its September 17<sup>th</sup> meeting. The resolution included the following value statements related to CTE:

- CTE has a positive impact on students who participate
- CTE is a critical tool in ensuring that secondary students are prepared for college and career when they leave high school
- State funding should incentivize better student outcomes, rather than focus solely on inputs

The resolution also included the following recommendations regarding CTE:

- CTE programs should place students and student outcomes at the center of their focus

- CTE programs and courses of study should align their delivery with post-secondary and workforce needs
- CTE program should recognize the value of work-based learning

While discussing the resolution, taskforce members agreed of the importance to indicate within the resolution that the study would be on-going, and expressed interest in devoting the next taskforce meeting to further exploration of the results of the study. The taskforce members agreed to modify the resolution and present it to the Career Council.

#### **IV. Adjournment**

Mr. Smith adjourned the meeting at 12pm.